[Service Date: September 24, 2004]

BEFORE THE WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION,

Complainant,

v.

ADVANCED TELCOM, INC., d/b/a ADVANCED TELCOM GROUP; AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE PACIFIC NORTHWEST and TCG SEATTLE; COVAD COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY: ELECTRIC LIGHTWAVE, LLC.; **ESCHELON TELECOM OF** WASHINGTON, INC.; FAIRPOINT CARRIER SERVICES, INC. f/k/a FAIRPOINT COMMUNICATIONS SOLUTIONS CORP.; GLOBAL CROSSING LOCAL SERVICES, INC.; INTEGRA TELECOM OF WASHINGTON, INC.; McLEODUSA, TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC.; SBC TELECOM, INC.; OWEST CORPORATION; WORLDCOM, INC.; and XO WASHINGTON, INC., f/k/a NEXTLINK COMMUNICATIONS, INC.,

Respondents.

Docket No. UT-033011

TWTC'S ANSWER TO QWEST'S MOTION TO STRIKE TESTIMONY

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Intervenor Time Warner Telecom of Washington, Inc. ("TWTC"), by and through its attorneys of record, Ater Wynne LLP, hereby submits its Answer to Owest's Motion to Strike

TWTC'S ANSWER TO QWEST'S MOTION TO STRIKE TESTIMONY (UT-033011) - Page 1 $\,$

Testimony of Stephen C. Gray and Richard A. Smith. TWTC opposes the motion and requests that the Commission deny it.

II. ARGUMENT

A. The Gray And Smith Testimonies Are Not Procedurally Inappropriate

- 2. The Gray and Smith testimonies are not procedurally inappropriate. As the Staff argues in its Response to Motion to Strike, the Commission has already approved the settlements and the process of submitting testimony from Messrs. Gray and Smith as "not unlawful or contrary to the public interest." Order No. 12, para. 31, 34, 44. The Gray and Smith testimonies constitute the testimonies of their respective companies, McLeod USA Telecommunications Services, Inc. ("McLeod") and Eschelon Telecom, Inc. ("Eschelon"), respectively, not that of Staff. Since they were submitted in response to agreements reached in Settlement Agreements, which were not executed until well after Staff filed its opening testimony in this case, it is illogical to argue that they should have been submitted as part of Staff's direct testimony.
- Further, in contrast to Qwest's argument, Qwest's due process rights are not compromised by the filing of the Gray and Smith testimonies. Under the procedural schedule adopted in this case, Qwest has ample opportunity to conduct discovery and respond to the Gray and Smith testimonies.

B. The Gray And Smith Testimonies Are Relevant

O.

(r.

- 4. The Gray and Smith testimonies are directly relevant to the issues in this case. Critically, from TWTC's perspective, they describe clearly the full extent and scope of the secret agreements between each of the two CLECs and Qwest, as well as the context in which the agreements were entered into, including the motivation of the parties and the damage to the marketplace that was occurring.
- 5. Qwest specifically attacks Mr. Gray's testimony that McLeod "had an oral agreement with Qwest that we believed entitled McLeod USA to a volume discount of between

6.5% and 10% on the products we purchased from Qwest" (Gray Testimony at 16, line 18-17, line 1), claiming that this "oral agreement" is not at issue in this case and cannot be the basis of penalties in this case. TWTC submits that the testimony is directly relevant and appropriate for two reasons. First, the testimony is relevant to the question of whether the "oral agreement" was in fact part of a larger interconnection agreement between McLeod and Qwest that should have been filed. Second, the testimony is relevant to the question of Qwest's culpability, including a pattern of conduct designed to cause damage to the marketplace.

C. Mr. Gray's Testimony Should Not Be Striken Because It Relies In Part On Hearsay.

- 6. Qwest's argument that Mr. Gray's testimony about the "oral agreement" for Qwest to provide a secret discount to McLeod should be striken because it relies on affidavits of two former employees, Blake Fisher and Lori Deutmeyer, is not well taken. First, the Washington Administrative Procedures Act, Chapter 34.05 RCW specifically permits agencies such as the Commission to admit and rely on hearsay evidence if in the judgment of the presiding officer it is the kind of evidence on which reasonably prudent persons are accustomed to rely in the conduct of their affairs." RCW 34.05.452(1). The hearsay evidence at issue is two sworn affidavits that were submitted in a Minnesota unfiled agreements case, certainly the kind of evidence reasonably prudent persons would rely upon. Courts also rely on sworn affidavits all the time.
- 7. Qwest's complaint really is that, because Mr. Fisher and Ms. Deutmeyer are former employees outside the control of McLeod, who reside beyond the subpoena power the Commission, it cannot compel their attendance at the hearing. However, as Qwest itself acknowledges, both affiants were deposed in the Minnesota proceeding by Qwest. Pursuant to

Civil Rule 32(a)(3)¹ their depositions can be introduced in this proceeding. Indeed, Staff in its Response to Qwest's motion states that it intends to do so. Thus, any hypothetical prejudice to Qwest will be cleared. There is no due process violation here.

III. CONCLUSION

8. For the reasons discussed above, TWTC requests that the Commission deny Qwest's Motion to Strike Testimony.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 24th day of September, 2004.

ATER WYNNE, LLP

Bν

Arthur A. Butler, WSFA # 04678 601 Union Street, Suite 5450

Seattle, WA 98101-2327 Tel: (206) 623-4711

Fax: (206) 467-8406 Email: aab@aterwynne.com

Attorneys for TWTC

¹ CR 32(a)(3) provides in pertinent part: "The deposition of a witness, whether or not a party, may be used by any party for any purpose if the court finds: ...(D) that the party offering the deposition has been unable to procure the attendance of the witness by subpoena ..."

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 24th day of September, 2004, served the true and correct original, along with the correct number of copies, of the foregoing document upon the WUTC, via the method(s) noted below, properly addressed as follows:

	Carole Washburn	Hand Delivered
	Executive Secretary	U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	Washington Utilities and Transportation	Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Commission	Facsimile (360) 586-1150
	1300 S Evergreen Park Drive SW	Email (records@wutc.wa.gov)
	Olympia, WA 98504-7250	
		of September, 2004, served a true and correct
		ecord, via the method(s) noted below, properly
addre	ssed as follows:	
On I	Behalf Of Eschelon:	
	Dennis D. Ahlers	Hand Delivered
	Eschelon Telecom, Inc.	U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	730 Second Avenue South, Suite 900	Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Minneapolis MN 55402-2489	Facsimile (612) 436-6792
	Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (ddahlers@eschelon.com)
On I	Behalf Of Advanced TelCom:	
	Victor A. Allums	Hand Delivered
	GF Business Productivity Solutions, Inc.	U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	3225 Cumberland Boulevard, Suite 700	Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Atlanta GA 30339	Facsimile (770) 644-7752
	Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (vic.allums@ge.com)
On i	Behalf Of Qwest:	
0 22 2	Lisa A. Anderl	/ Hand Delivered
	Qwest Corporation	
	1600 7th Avenue, Room 3206	U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Seattle WA 98191	Facsimile (206) 343-4040
	Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Email (lisa.anderl@qwest.com)

On Behalf Of Electric Lightwave:	
Mr. Charles L. Best Electric Lightwave Inc. 4400 NE 77th Ave Vancouver WA 98662 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 816-0999 Email (charles_best@eli.net)
On Behalf Of Advanced TelCom:	
Lon E. Blake Advanced TelCom, Inc. 3723 Fairview Industrial Drive SE Salem OR 97302 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile Email (lblake@atgi.net)
On Behalf Of AT&T:	
Cathy L. Brightwell AT&T Government Affairs 2120 Caton Way SW, Suite B Olympia WA 98502-1106 Confidentiality Status: Public On Behalf Of Eschelon: Richard J. Busch Graham & Dunn, PC Pier 70 2801 Alaskan Way, Suite 300 Seattle WA 98121-1128 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 705-4177 Email (brightwell@att.com) Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 340-9599 Email (rbusch@grahamdunn.com)
On Behalf Of McLeodUSA:	er Major
William Courter McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services, Inc. McLeod USA Technology Park 6400 C Street SW PO Box 3177 Cedar Rapids IA 52405-3177	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (319) 790-7901 Email (wcourter@mcleodusa.com)

Confidentiality Status: Public

On Behalf Of Public Counsel:	
Robert W. Cromwell Jr. Attorney General of Washington Public Counsel Section 900 Fourth Avenue, Suite 2000 Seattle WA 98164-1012	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 389-2058 Email (RobertC1@atg.wa.gov)
Confidentiality Status: Confidential	
On Behalf Of WorldCom:	
Haleh S. Davary MCI, Inc. 201 Spear Street, Ninth Floor San Francisco CA 94105 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (415) 228-1094 Email (Haleh.Davary@mci.com)
On Behalf Of Advanced TelCom:	
Erin W. Emmott Kelley Drye & Warren LLP 1200 19th Street NW, Suite 500 Washington DC 20036-2423	Hand Delivered U.S. Maii (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (202) 955-9792 Email (eemmott@kelleydrye.com)
Confidentiality Status: Public	
On Behalf Of Eschelon:	
Judith Endejan Graham & Dunn, PC Pier 70 2801 Alaskan Way, Suite 300 Seattle WA 98121-1128 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 340-9599 Email (jendejan@grahamdunn.com)
On Police of Counts	
On Behalf Of Covad: Ms. Karen S. Frame Covad Communications Company 7901 Lowry Boulevard Denver CO 80230-6906 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (720) 208-3350 Email (kframe@covad.com)

Confidentiality Status: Public

On Be	ehalf Of AT&T:		
	Letty S. Friesen AT&T Communications of the Pacific		Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	Northwest		Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Law Department		Facsimile (303) 298-6301
	1875 Lawrence Street, Suite 1500 Denver CO 80202		Email (Isfriesen@att.com)
	Confidentiality Status: Public		
On Be	ehalf Of Covad:		
	Lynn Hankins		Hand Delivered
	Covad Communications Company		U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	7901 Lowry Boulevard		Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Denver CO 80230-6906		Facsimile (720) 208-3350
·.	Confidentiality Status: Public	_X.	Email (lhankins@covad.com)
álu R	ehalf Of McLeodUSA:		
<i>!)# .</i> b(Hand Delivered
•	Lauraine Harding McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services,	·	
	inc.		Overnight Mail (UPS)
	6400 C Street SW	• .	Facsimile (319) 790-7901
• •	PO Box 3177		Email
	Cedar Rapids IA 52405-3177		
	Considertiality Status: Public		, A
On Be	ehalf Of Advanced TelCom, Covad & GE		
Busin	ess Productivity:		Hand Delivered
	Brooks E. Harlow		U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	Miller Nash LLP		Overnight Mail (UPS)
•	601 Union Street, Suite 440()		Facsimile (206) 622-7485
	Seattle WA 98101-1367	<u>X</u> _	Email (brooks.harlow@millernash.com)
	Confidentiality Status: Confidential		•
On B	ehalf Of XO:		
	Rex Knowles	· · ·	Hand Delivered
•	XO Oregon, Inc.		U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)
	111 E Broadway, Suite 1000		Overnight Mail (UPS)
	Salt Lake City UT 84111	-;_	Facsimile (801) 983-1667
	Confidentiality Status:	_X	Email (rex.knowles@xo.com)

On B	ehalf Of Global Crossing & XO:		
	Gregory J. Kopta Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1501 4th Avenue, Suite 2600 Seattle WA 98101-1688 Confidentiality Status: Public	<u></u>	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 628-7699 Email (gregkopta@dwt.com)
On B	ehalf Of McLeodUSA:		
	Dan Lipschultz Moss & Barnett 4800 Wells Fargo Center 90 South 7th Street Minneapolis MN 55402	X	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (612) 339-6686 Email (lipschultz@moss-barnett.com)
	Confidentiality Status: Public		
On B	ehalf Of Qwest:		
	Todd Lundy Qwest Corporation 1801 California Street, Suite 4700 Denver CO 80202 Confidentiality Status: Confidential		Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (303) 295-7069 Email (todd.lundy@qwest.com)
On B	ehalf Of Qwest:		
	Cynthia Mitchell Hogan & Hartson L.L.P. 1470 Walnut Street, Suite 200 Boulder CO 80302 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	<u> </u>	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (720) 406-5301 Email (cmitchell@hhlaw.com)
On B	ehalf Of Advanced TelCom:		
a e	Brad E. Mutschelknaus Kelley Drye & Warren LLP 1200 19th Street NW, Suite 500 Washington DC 20036-2423 Confidentiality Status: Public		Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (202) 955-9792 Email (bmutschelknaus@kelleydrye.com)

On Behalf Of WUTC:	
Ann E. Rendahl ALJ Washington Utilities and Transportation Commission 1300 S Evergreen Park Drive SW PO Box 47250 Olympia WA 98504-7250	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 586-8203 Email (arendahl@wutc.wa.gov)
Confidentiality Status: Public	
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Mark S. Reynolds Qwest Corporation 1600 7th Avenue, Room 3206 Seattle WA 98191	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 346-7289
Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (mark.reynolds3@qwest.com)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Martha Russo Hogan & Hartson L.L.P. 555 Thirteenth Street NW Washington DC 20004 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (202) 637-5910 Email (mlrusso@hhlaw.com)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Adam L. Sherr Qwest Corporation 1600 7th Avenue, Room 3206 Seattle WA 98191 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 343-4040 Email (adam sherr@qwest.com)
On Behalf Of Global Crossing:	
Michael Shortley Global Crossing 1080 Pittsford-Victor Road Pittsford NY 14534 Confidentiality Status:	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (585) 381-6781 Email

On Behalf Of MCI:	
Michel L. Singer Nelson MCI, Inc. 707 17th Street, Suite 4200 Denver CO 80202-3432 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (303) 390-6333 Email (michel.singer_nelson@mci.com)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Peter S. Spivack Hogan & Hartson L.L.P. 555 Thirteenth Street NW Washington DC 20004 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (202) 637-5910 Email (psspivack@hhlaw.com)
On Behalf Of AT&T:	
Mary Steele Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1501 4th Avenue, Suite 2600 Seattle WA 98101-1688 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 628-7699 Email (marysteele@dwt.com)
O. B. L. ICOCEL Y. L.	
On Behalf Of Electric Lightwave: Aloa Stevens Electric Lightwave Inc. 4 Triad Center, Suite 200 Salt Lake City UT 84180 Confidentiality Status:	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (801) 924-0640 Email (astevens@czn.com)
On Behalf Of Staff:	
Christopher G. Swanson Attorney General of Washington Utilities & Transportation Division 1400 S Evergreen Park Drive SW PO Box 40128 Olympia WA 98504-0128	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 586-3564 Email (cswanson@wutc.wa.gov)

Confidentiality Status: Public

On Behalf Of AT&T:	
Mary Taylor AT&T Government Affairs 2120 Caton Way SW, Suite B Olympia WA 98502-1106	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 705-4177 Email (marymtaylor@att.com)
Confidentiality Status: Public	Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z
On Behalf Of Time Warner Telecom:	
Brian D. Thomas Time Warner Telecom 223 Taylor Avenue North Seattle WA 98109-5017 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 676-8001 Email (brian.thomas@twtelecom.com)
On Behalf Of AT&T:	one de la company de la compa
Mary B. Tribby AT&T Communications 1875 Lawrence Street Denver CO 80202 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (303) 298-6301 Email (mbtribby@att.com)
On Behalf Of Global Crossing:	
Mark P. Trinchero Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1300 SW Fifth Avenue. Suite 2300 Portland OR 97201-5682 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (503) 778-5299 Email (marktrinchero@dwt.com)
On Behalf Of AT&T:	
Daniel M. Waggoner Esq. Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1501 4th Avenue, Suite 2600 Seattle WA 98101-1688 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 628-7699 Email (danwaggoner@dwt.com)

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington that the foregoing is true and correct.

TWTC'S ANSWER TO QWEST'S MOTION TO STRIKE TESTIMONY (UT-033011) - Page 12

DATED this 24th day of September, 2004, at Seattle, Washington.