BEFORE THE WASHINGTON STATE UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION,

Docket No. TG-230778

Complainant,

v.

MURREY'S DISPOSAL COMPANY, INC. d/b/a OLYMPIC DISPOSAL,

Respondent.

RESPONDENT MURREY'S DISPOSAL COMPANY, INC'S

REBUTTAL TESTIMONY

OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO

SCONTRINO-POWELL, INC.

June 28, 2024

v	Vitness: M. Pete	Exh. MPS-1T er Scontrino, Ph.D.
ITENITO		

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2	I.	IDENTIFICATION OF WITNESS	1
3	II.	SUMMARY OF TESTIMONY	1
4	III.	"NORMAL" MEANS AN EXPENSE OCCURS THROUGH THE REGULAR OPERATIONS OF THE COMPANY	2
5	IV.	DEMONSTRABLE EVIDENCE THAT CUSTOMERS BENEFIT FROM THE EXPENSES	5
6	V.	MANAGEMENT DISCRETION REGARDING BONUSES	16
7	VI.	SEVERANCE PAYMENTS	19
	VII.	. CONCLUSION	21
8			

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - i

4886-6877-5628.1

1		EXHIBIT LIST			
2		Exhibit No.	Description		Page Referenced
3		PS-2	Curriculum Vitae of Peter Scontrino,	Ph.D.	Referenced
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
	RESPO	NDENT'S REBUT	TAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCON	TRINO - ii	
	4886-6877-	-5628.1			

I. IDENTIFICATION OF WITNESS

Please state your name, business address and role at Scontrino-Powell, Inc.

My name is Dr. M. Peter Scontrino, Founder and Senior Consultant for Scontrino-Powell,
Inc., which provides customer-focused and cost-effective consulting services to
businesses in array of industries, including for-profit and non-profit companies, as well as
those operating in regulated industries. My business address is 9605 Fauntleroy Way
SW, Seattle, WA 98136.

II. SUMMARY OF TESTIMONY

Will you please describe the purpose of your testimony in this proceeding?

A. Mr. Benjamin Sharbono provided testimony on behalf of the Commission Staff in response to the prefiled testimony filed by Mark Gingrich, Branko Terzic, and Joe Wonderlick. The purpose of my testimony is to respond to certain portions of Mr. Sharbono's testimony where he inaccurately analyzed Olympic's bonus and incentive plans and, in-turn, wrongly recommended the removal of certain expenses from the Company's rate case. In so doing, I highlight academic studies, literature, data and evidence compiled by professionals in my field who have long-studied and evaluated programs and protocols such as I discuss below.

Q. How is your testimony organized?

A. My testimony addresses the testimony offered by Mr. Sharbono concerning Waste
Connections' bonus structure and, specifically, addresses four of the assertions he made:
(1) "normal" means that the expense occurs through the regular operations of the
company,¹ (2) demonstrable evidence that customers benefit from company expenses is

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 1

4886-6877-5628.1

Q.

A.

Q.

¹ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 5:20-6:2.

Exh. MPS-1T Witness: M. Peter Scontrino, Ph.D.

required,² (3) bonuses are available to customers and paid to customers at the discretion

of management,³ and (4) Waste Connections' justification for severance payments.⁴

Specifically, my testimony is organized as follows:

Organization of Testimony

I. Identification of Witness	
II. Summary of Testimony	
III. "Normal" Means an Expense Occurs through	
Company's Regular Operations	
IV. Demonstrable Evidence that Customers Benefi	t from
the Expenses	
V. Management Discretion Regarding Bonuses	
VI. Severance Payments	
XI. Conclusion	

III. "NORMAL" MEANS AN EXPENSE OCCURS THROUGH THE REGULAR OPERATIONS OF THE COMPANY

Q. In his testimony, did Mr. Sharbono comment on that which constitutes a "normal" company expense?

A. Yes. Mr. Sharbono stated, in part, that "Normal means that the expense occurs through

the regular operations of the company, required to provide the service, and not in

combination with unusual circumstances."5

Q. Do you agree with that characterization of a company's "normal" costs?

20 A. I do.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

Q. Are incentive plans, for instance, normal for companies in the United States?

A. They are.

Q. Do you have data to support this opinion?

² Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 23:1-5.

³ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 25:9-16.

⁴ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 19:12-14.

⁵ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 5:3-5.

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 2

- A. Yes, I do. The vast majority of organizations in the United States have incentive plans. A breakdown of these organizations is the following:
 - 99% of publicly traded companies
 - 93% of privately held companies
 - 82% of nonprofit organizations
 - 58% of government organizations

These statistics clearly demonstrate that incentive pay is "normal" and occurs through the regular operation of the majority of companies and organizations in the United States.

Olympic's utilization of incentive plans should be treated as "normal" since they are the

type of expenses which are utilized in the regular operation of the majority of companies

throughout the United States.

Q. Can you elaborate on that data, including the source of the data?

Yes, I can. More detailed information on incentive programs is included in the below

Table 1.

A.

Incentive	Saturation	Source	Additional Information
Program			
Spot	*ALL INDUSTRY:	* <u>SHRM</u>	
Bonus/	51% medium sized companies (100-499)	Employee	
Award	50% of large companies (500-4,999) use spot bonus/rewards.	Benefits Survey, 2023	
	*CONSTRUCTION/UTILITIES/AGRICULTURE INDUSTRY SPECIFIC: 49% medium sized 62% large sized **GOVERNMENT: 47%	**World At Work Study Govt, 2021 (pg. 4)	
Sign-on	33.97% of companies are using sign-on bonuses to	Salary.com	
Bonus	address labor market demands including inflation	<u>Survey</u> , 2022	
		(survey is in referenced	
		document	
		folder, see chart	
		on pg. 2) $N =$	
		301	

1	Incentive	Note that a sign-on bonus can also be contingent	<u>SHRM</u>	
1	Bonus Plan	upon the employee achieving specific goals or	Employee Benefits Survey,	
2		staying with the company for a certain period.	2023	
2		Because of this, I have included information for		
3		"Incentive Bonus Plan" since it's likely that "sign- on bonus" likely fell into this category for the		
5		SHRM source.		
4		Sinch source.		
		ALL INDUSTRY:		
5		57% mid-sized		
		55% large-sized		
6		CONSTRUCTION/UTILITIES/AGRICULTURE		
_		INDUSTRY SPECIFIC: 66% mid-sized		
7		72% large-sized		
0	Retention	*ALL INDUSTRY:	*SHRM	
8	Bonus	24% mid-sized	Employee	
9		34% large-sized	Benefits Survey,	
		CONSTRUCTION/UTILITIES/AGRICULTURE	2023	
10		INDUSTRY SPECIFIC:	**World At	
10		25% mid-sized	Work Study	
11		36% large-sized	Govt, 2021 (pg.	
		**GOVERNMENT:	4) N=36	
12		25%	*** <u>Salary.com</u>	
10			<u>Survey</u> , 2022	
13		***18% of companies are using retention bonuses	(*survey is also in document	
14		to explicitly address labor market demands	folder, see chart	
14		including inflation	on pg. 2)	
15	Referral	ALL INDUSTRY:	SHRM	
15	Incentive	67% mid-sized	Employee Benefits Survey,	
16		68% large-sized CONSTRUCTION/UTILITIES/AGRICULTURE	2023	
		INDUSTRY SPECIFIC:		
17		75% mid-sized		
		67% large-sized		
18	Safety	25% of manufacturers	U.S. Govt	"Incentive programs can be an
10	Incentive		Accountability	important tool to promote
19			<u>Office</u> , 2010	workplace safety and health. One type of incentive
20				program rewards workers for
20				reporting near-misses or
21				hazards, and encourages involvement in a safety and
				health management
22				system. Positive action taken
				under this type of program is
23				always permissible under § 1904.35(b)(1)(iv). Another
24				type of incentive program is
24				rate-based and focuses on
				reducing the number of
				reported injuries and illnesses. This type of
				program typically rewards
				employees with a prize or
				bonus at the end of an injury-
	RESPONDE	NT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER	SCONTRINO - 4	ł

Exh. MPS-1T Witness: M. Peter Scontrino, Ph.D.

			for a manufly and some location
			free month or evaluates managers based on their work
			unit's lack of injuries."
			- <u>OSHA</u> , 2018
			(Bad program: reward for "no
			injuries reported"
			Good program: reward for
			reporting near misses or for
			wearing safety gloves)
			A study showed that
			construction worksites that
			implemented a safety
			incentive program saw a
			44.16% reduction in the mea
			lost-time workday injury rate
			Sites without the program ha a 41.84% increase in the mea
			lost-time workday injury rate
			- Goodrum & Gangwar, 2010
			(pg. 8)
Severance	39% of employers offer severance	Randstad, 2023	
Pay		(pg. 11, see	
-		"cash payout")	1

IV. DEMONSTRABLE EVIDENCE EXISTS SHOWING CUSTOMERS BENEFIT FROM OLYMPIC'S BONUS EXPENSES

Q. What is another reason Mr. Sharbono took issue with Olympic's bonus program?

A. Mr. Sharbono asserted that the Staff "removed or modified bonuses, performance pay,

and incentive pay because the Commission has indicated that allowable bonus and

incentive pay programs require demonstrable evidence that customers benefit from the

expenses." Mr. Sharbono stated, "[t]he documentation provided by the company did not

show the programs enhance service or customer experience."⁶

Q. Do you agree that Olympic's bonus programs do not enhance service or customer experience?

A. I do not.

Q. On what do you base that belief?

⁶ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 23:1-5. RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 5

			,	
1	A.	Largely empirical evidence. Each of the incentives used by Olympic is used by many		
2		organizations throughout the United States. A breakdown of	usage is the following:	
3	•	Sign On Incentive Program	34%	
4	•	Stay On Incentive Program	25%	
5	•	Referral Incentive Program	67%	
6 7	•	Safety Culture Incentive Program	25%	
8		More detailed information is included in my earlier testimon	y, at Table 1 .	
9	Q.	Do you believe the type of incentives utilized by Olympic benefit customers?		
10	A.	I do, because industry information is clear that these type of programs can have a		
11		significant impact on business performance resulting in enha	nced customer service.	
12	Q.	Can this benefit be measured?		
13	A.	In some cases it can, but such benefits can be difficult to measure on an ad hoc basis,		
14 15		including in the case of Olympic Disposal.		
16	Q.	Why is that?		
17	A.	It is difficult to show a direct link between any of Olympic's	incentives and customers	
18		benefiting from those incentives because of the small sample	e size of one company and	
19		the possible interactions between various incentives and other factors. An analogy would		
20		be to test the impact of an experimental drug on one patient. Clinical trials are conducted		
21 22		using hundreds or thousands of patients to determine the imp	pact of the drug. In a similar	
22		vein, I have consulted and cited data based on thousands of c	organizations to show the	
24		potential impact of the types of incentives utilized by Olymp	ic.	

Q. What does that show as it concerns sign-on incentive programs?

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 6

A.

Sign-on (otherwise known as "onboarding") incentive programs can significantly impact various aspects of employee integration, performance, and retention. Peer-reviewed studies provide a wealth of information on these impacts, underscoring the importance of well-designed incentive strategies. The key findings from those studies are the following:
1. Increased Employee Retention: A study published in *Personnel Review* found that organizations that offered pay-for-performance incentives (such as sign-on bonuses) lose significantly fewer new hires.⁷ Well-supported and engaged employees feel more connected to their new workplace and are less likely to leave prematurely.

2. Higher Employee Satisfaction, Commitment, and Trust: According to a study
published in the *Human Resource Management Journal*, performance-related pay (which includes sign-on incentives) was positively associated with job satisfaction, employee
commitment to the organization, and trust in management.⁸

3. **Improved Performance**: Research published in *The Review of Financial Studies* indicates that new hires who receive a signing bonus work harder.⁹ The same research found that a signing bonus incentive is also a tool used to attract higher-quality talent, as it is perceived as a signal of company quality.

4. **Employee Motivation:** Signing bonuses can enhance new employee motivation and commitment to the organization. Research published in *The Accounting Review* by Choi (2014) found that multiple studies emphasize workers' marginal productivity of effort as a mechanism by which signing bonuses affect effort.¹⁰ Choi also found that a signing

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 7

⁷ Selden et al., *Personnel Review* (2013).

⁸ Ogbonnaya et al., *Human Resource Management Journal* (2017).

⁹ Dickersin Van Wesep, *The Review of Financial Studies* (2010).

¹⁰ Choi, *The Accounting Review* (2014).

bonus can positively affect worker effort by conveying trust and appealing to worker reciprocity.

Q. How would you summarize the effectiveness of sign-on incentive programs?

A. The impact of sign-on incentive programs, as demonstrated in peer-reviewed journals, is multifaceted. They lead to higher retention rates, better employee engagement and satisfaction, improved performance, and enhanced motivation and commitment.
 Organizations that invest in well-designed incentives are likely to see significant benefits in terms of employee recruitment, retention, and productivity.

Q. Is there similar data for "stay on" retention programs and, if so, what does it say?

- A. There are such data. Retention incentive programs are designed to keep key employees in an organization by offering financial rewards and other benefits. Peer-reviewed journals provide evidence of the value and impact of these programs in several ways:
 - Reduced Turnover: A study published in the *Journal of Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis* found that retention bonuses effectively decrease turnover rates while allowing for the retention of high-quality employees.¹¹
 - 2. **Improved Performance**: Research published in *Performance Improvement* indicates that retention bonuses and other incentives not only retain employees but also motivate them to perform better, as high performers are immediately rewarded and there is also a promise of future high rewards for continued performance.¹²
 - 3. Enhanced Employee Engagement: According to a study in the *Journal of Humanities and Social Studies*, when a company improves its employee rewards

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 8

 ¹¹ Springer et al., Journal of Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis (2016).
 ¹² Nisar, Performance Improvement (2006).

system, to include retention bonuses, there can be increased levels of employee engagement. Engaged employees are more likely to stay with the company and contribute positively to its culture and success.¹³

4. Cost-Savings: While the upfront cost of retention bonuses might seem significant, they can be cost-effective in the long run. A study published in the *Human Resource Management Journal* notes the high replacement costs that come with losing high performers.¹⁴ Additionally, the study also found that high performers cite extrinsic rewards (such as retention bonuses) as reasons reported for staying with an organization.

5. **Customer Satisfaction**: A study in *Academy of Management* finds that quits and dismissals are significantly related to customer satisfaction, where high employee turnover was associated with a decrease in customer satisfaction.¹⁵ This is particularly impactful for companies that value customer loyalty.

Q. How would you summarize the effectiveness of retention incentive programs?

A. In summary, peer-reviewed studies consistently show that retention incentive programs offer multiple benefits, including reduced turnover, improved performance, higher engagement, cost-savings, and customer satisfaction. These advantages underline the strategic importance of such programs in managing and retaining talent within organizations.

Did you consider Olympic's employee referral program incentive?

||Q.

A.

I did.

¹³ Miawati et al., Journal of Humanities and Social Studies (2020).

¹⁴ Hausknecht et al., *Human Resource Management Journal* (2009).

¹⁵ Batt, R., & Colvin, A. J. S., Academy of Management (2011).

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 9

A.

Q. Is there support for the proposition that such incentives benefit customers?

There is. Research published in the *Human Resource Management Journal* has provided compelling evidence that employee referrals result in positive organizational outcomes.¹⁶ Referral bonus presence, amount, and organizational commitment all positively correlate to the likelihood of referrals. Here are key insights from additional peer-reviewed journals that further elaborate on the efficacy of having an employee referral program incentive:

Reduced Hiring Costs: A study by Zottoli and Wanous (2000) in *Human Resource* Management Review found that employee referrals are often the most effective way of finding and hiring new talent.¹⁷ The researchers go on to say that employee referrals are seen as an inexpensive source that consistently yields higher performing employees at relatively little cost to the organization.

2. Higher Quality Candidates: Research published in the *Journal of Applied*

Psychology indicates that referring employees are likely to offer detailed information about a job's positive and negative aspects to the candidate, and, ultimately, refer a candidate that fits the job description.¹⁸

3. **Increased Retention**: Schlachter and Pieper (2019) also note that there is significant research that reveals a robust positive connection between referred workers and retention.¹⁹

¹⁹ Id.

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 10

¹⁶ Pieper et al., *Human Resource Management Journal* (2017).

¹⁷ Zottoli and Wanous, Human Resource Management Review (2000).

¹⁸ Schlachter and Pieper, Journal of Applied Psychology (2019).

- 4. Employee Satisfaction: Referred employees not only have higher levels of job involvement and organizational commitment, but they also showed significantly higher levels of job satisfaction, as highlighted by a study by Latham and Leddy (1987) in the *Journal of Business and Psychology*.²⁰
- 5. Higher Performance: Referred employees often exhibit higher performance levels. Research published in the American Journal of Sociology by Castilla (2005) indicates that referred employees were more productive in the short run than non-referred employees.²¹ Castilla goes on to note that there are clear productivity advantages of using referral programs and the bonuses associated with them.
- 6. **Faster Onboarding**: Referrals are more likely to be hired and to complete their training, contributing to a faster onboarding process, as Castilla (2005) indicated in the *American Journal of Sociology*.²²
- 7. Employee Engagement and Morale: Referral programs can boost engagement and morale for both the referrer and the referred, as indicated in the *Journal of Applied Psychology* by Schlachter and Pieper (2019).²³ This is because employees selectively refer from their social networks, and the hiring of a friend or acquaintance leads to a socially enriched work environment.
- 8. Incentive Value and Structure: A review in the Human Resource Management Journal found that monetary incentives, ranging from \$250 to \$5,000, are common and effective for referral bonuses.²⁴ The research also suggested it is important to
- 24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

²² Id.

²⁰ Latham and Leddy, *Journal of Business and Psychology* (1987).

²¹ Castilla, American Journal of Sociology (2005).

²³ Schlachter and Pieper, *Journal of Applied Psychology* (2019).

²⁴ Pieper et al., *Human Resource Management Journal* (2017).

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 11

balance the incentive value to ensure it is attractive enough to motivate employees without leading to abuses of the program.

Q. How would you summarize the effectiveness of referral program incentives?

A. Peer-reviewed studies consistently demonstrate that employee referral programs provide significant added value to organizations. They help reduce hiring costs, improve the quality of hires, increase retention rates, enhance performance, and boost employee engagement. The value of the incentives offered in these programs should be carefully calibrated to maximize these benefits while maintaining fairness and sustainability.

Q. Can employee engagement ultimately benefit customers?

It can and typically does. Having an engaged workforce offers substantial value to A. 12 organizations, affecting various aspects of business performance positively. This reality 13 has been analyzed by other experts in my field. Some of the key benefits, and the 14 supporting research, are the following:

1. **Increased Performance**: Research published in *Personnel Psychology* showed that engaged employees are more motivated, leading to higher levels of job performance.²⁵

- 2. **Improved Employee Retention**: Engagement reduces turnover rates. A study published in the Journal of Applied Psychology showed that employee engagement is related to meaningful business outcomes such as a decrease in employee turnover.²⁶
- 3. Enhanced Customer Satisfaction: Harter et al. (2002) found that employee engagement is related to higher customer satisfaction and loyalty.²⁷

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

²⁵ Christian et al., Personnel Psychology (2011).

²⁶ Harter et al., Journal of Applied Psychology (2002).

²⁷ Id.

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 12

- 4. Increase in Organizational Citizenship Behaviors: Christian et al. (2011) also found that engaged employees are more likely to perform extra-role behaviors, pursuing activities helpful to the organization that are not part of their job description.²⁸
- 5. Reduced Absenteeism: Engagement is linked to lower absenteeism. A study published in *Personnel Psychology* showed that employees who are engaged are less likely to have absence from sickness.²⁹

Q. How would you summarize the benefit of an engaged workforce?

A. In summary, the value of having an engaged workforce is multifaceted, impacting productivity, retention, customer satisfaction, innovation, and absenteeism. Engaging employees is a strategic investment that yields significant returns across various dimensions of customer benefits and business success.

Q. Did you consider Olympic's safety incentive which Mr. Sharbono addressed in his testimony?

A. Yes, I did.

Q. What is the value of a safety incentive program to a company?

A. Safety incentive programs are implemented to enhance workplace safety by encouraging employees to adhere to safety protocols and reduce the incidence of accidents and injuries. This is especially important in the transportation industry. Peer-reviewed journals provide substantial evidence of the value and impact of these programs:

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 13

²⁸ Christian et al., *Personnel Psychology* (2011).

²⁹ Shao et al., *Personnel Psychology* (2020).

- Reduction in Workplace Accidents: A study published in the *Journal of Safety Science* found that safety incentive programs significantly reduce the number of workplace accidents. The research demonstrated that organizations with such programs experienced a 75% decrease in accident rates compared to those without them.³⁰
- 2. **Improved Safety Compliance**: Safety incentives can lead to better compliance with safety regulations and protocols. Research in the *Journal of Applied Psychology* found that employees are more likely to follow safety guidelines when they are rewarded for safe behaviors, resulting in a safer work environment.³¹
- 3. **Reduction in Lost Workdays**: Implementing safety incentive programs can lead to substantial cost savings for organizations. A study in the *Journal of Safety Research* highlighted that companies with effective safety programs had a statistically significant reduction in the OSHA Lost Time Injury Rate.³²
- 4. Enhanced Safety Culture: Safety incentive programs contribute to the development of a positive safety culture within organizations. According to research in the *Journal of Safety Research*, rewarding those who work safely is critical to a positive safety culture.³³
- 5. **Employee Motivation and Engagement**: Safety incentives also positively impact employee engagement. Research published in the *Journal of Applied Psychology* found that creating a supportive safety climate (where positive safety behaviors are

³⁰ Yeow & Goomas, *Journal of Safety Science* (2014).

³¹ Neal, A., & Griffin, M. A., Journal of Applied Psychology (2006).

³² O'Toole, M., *Journal of Safety Research* (2002).

³³ Frazier et al., Journal of Safety Research (2013).

rewarded) both motivates employees and positively relates to employee engagement.³⁴

Q. As you have done with other incentive programs in this testimony, could you please summarize the benefit of safety benefits?

A. Yes, I can. In summary, the value of safety incentive programs is well-documented in peer-reviewed literature. These types of programs lead to reduced workplace accidents, improved compliance with safety protocols, reduced lost workdays, enhanced safety culture, and higher employee motivation and engagement. Implementing such programs is a strategic investment in both employee well-being and organizational efficiency.

Q. Did you also consider Olympic's accounts receivable incentive plan?

A. I did. These type of programs are commonplace and can generally improve organizational performance. The textbook *Accounts Receivable Management Best Practices* notes that accounts receivable (AR) incentive plans are extremely useful in motivating employees to optimize the collection of outstanding receivables, thereby improving financial and employee metrics.³⁵ Peer-reviewed journals provide evidence of the value and impact of these incentive plans, including the following:

 Reduction in A/R Days: A study published in *Healthcare Financial Management* showed AR incentive plans can reduce the number of days an account is delinquent by notable amounts.³⁶ This not only reduces debt risk for the organization but also improves customer experience.

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 15

³⁴ Nahrgang et al., *Journal of Applied Psychology* (2011).

³⁵ Salek, Accounts Receivable Management Best Practices (2005).

³⁶ Kivimaki, *Healthcare Financial Management* (2007).

- 2. Enhanced Employee Performance and Motivation: According to a study in the *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, incentive plans improve employee performance and motivation.³⁷ In the context of accounts receivable, employees are more likely to exceed collection targets and enhance their productivity when they receive financial rewards for their efforts. The same study noted that employees are more apt to be interested in their daily job activities and have a positive mood at work also.
- 3. **Improved Financial Metrics:** Research published in *Management Science* showed that even small changes in accounts receivable collection could result in a relatively sizable change in working capital.³⁸

Q. Could you please summarize the benefit of Olympic's accounts receivable incentive plan?

A. Sure. In summary, peer-reviewed research demonstrates that accounts receivable incentive plans provide multiple benefits, including improved financial metrics and enhanced employee performance, leading to positive organizational impact. These plans are effective tools for managing receivables more efficiently and fostering a performance-oriented work environment and also reduce the overall percentage of bad debt for a company.

V. MANAGEMENT DISCRETION REGARDING BONUSES Q. Do you take issue with any other aspect of Mr. Sharbono's testimony and, if so, what part?

³⁷ Eisenberger et al., *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* (1999).
 ³⁸ Frankel et al., *Management Science* (2017).

A. Yes, I do. For instance, Mr. Sharbono wrote, "Staff has concerns about the continuity of the bonus programs, as all programs included statements that the amount of the bonus is [at] the discretion of management and condition of receipt of a bonus on management approval."³⁹ Mr. Sharbono also stated, "the bonus program would not be recurring and normal, or meet the known and measurable criteria for including in rates. Changing or cancelling bonus programs certainly casts doubts on the benefits of the program to customers."⁴⁰ Mr. Sharbono is concerned that "management can revise or eliminate programs in order to affect earnings."⁴¹ I disagree with these contentions in a number of ways.

11 Q. Cou

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Could you elaborate on that?

A. Yes. Managerial discretion in employee bonuses or incentive programs is also a topic that has garnered substantial interest in peer-reviewed academic literature. Depending on company size, 30% to 60% of companies with bonuses include management discretion for directing those plans. The exception is bonus plans that are part of a contract. For instance, managerial discretion allows for the customization of bonuses and incentives based on individual and team performance, which can lead to enhanced motivation and better alignment with organizational goals. Managers can recognize and reward employees who make significant contributions, even if these contributions are not directly tied to pre-set performance metrics. This recognition can foster a positive work environment and higher levels of employee engagement.

24

³⁹ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 25:1-11.

⁴⁰ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 25:13-16.

⁴¹ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CTr at 25:20-21.

Q.

1

In the Murrey's Olympic Disposal discretionary bonus plans that you reviewed for
your testimony, did you observe any concerns with consistency and transparency?
No. Both the Safety Incentive Program and the Stay On Bonus Agreement have clear
rules spelled out for each program on a document that each employee signs. The rules are
clear. The Tooty, Employee Referral, and I-Rate Programs all include one or two page
program descriptions that employees receive during onboarding, are posted on bulletin
boards, and discussed at department meetings.

Q. Are there any other benefits to allowing for managerial discretion concerning bonuses?

A. Yes, managerial discretion provides the flexibility to adapt incentive programs to changing business conditions and individual employee circumstances. This adaptability is crucial in dynamic environments where rigid incentive structures may be ineffective. By allowing managers to reward innovative and creative efforts, discretionary bonuses can encourage employees to think outside the box and contribute to the organization's longterm success.

Q. Are there any concerns relating to managerial discretion concerning bonuses?

A. There are some concerns and risks. One of the primary concerns with managerial discretion is the potential for bias and favoritism. If not carefully monitored, discretionary bonuses can lead to perceptions of unfairness and decrease overall morale. Ensuring consistency and transparency in the application of discretionary bonuses is critical. Employees need to understand the criteria for receiving bonuses to trust the system and feel that rewards are distributed fairly. However, because of the potential risk that bias in

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 18

award might be a factor, Mr. Sharbono seems almost to have automatically concluded that they should be disallowed.

Q. Are there any other benefits to managerial discretion concerning bonuses?

A. Yes. Studies have shown a positive correlation between managerial discretion in incentive programs and overall organizational performance. When managers fairly and effectively exercise discretion, it can lead to improved employee performance, higher job satisfaction, and better retention rates. Discretionary incentive programs can be tailored to align with strategic goals, ensuring that employee efforts are directed towards areas that are most beneficial for the organization.

Q. Would you like to make any other points on the issue of management's role in achieving organizational goals?

A. I would. The role of management is to create an environment that facilitates the accomplishment of organizational goals. This point has been highlighted by Peter
Drucker who is widely noted as the father of modern management, as well as Warren
Bennis who is seen as the father of modern leadership. Both of these experts would agree that Olympic management has used incentives and other management tools to create an environment that engages their employees.

VI. SEVERANCE PAYMENTS

Q. Are there any other aspects of Mr. Sharbono's testimony you would care to rebut?A. Yes, I would like to rebut the portion of his testimony concerning severance packages, which are commonly negotiated for higher-level executives or long-tenured employees.

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 19

Severance is often provided in exchange for a release of legal claims against the employer.⁴²

Q. Is there a value or impact of paying severance to a fired employee?

A. There is. According to the Society for Human Resource Management, 96% of U.S. businesses report offering severance to their employees. Employers often choose to pay severance to an employee being let go for several legal, strategic, and ethical reasons. The *Society of Human Resource Management* offers the primary reason for a severance package is avoiding future lawsuits, where the employee signs a release in exchange for the severance.

Q.

Q. Are there any other reasons to offer severance pay?

A. Yes. Providing severance actually demonstrates to remaining employees that the company is fair and compassionate, which can help maintain morale and productivity, particularly during transitional periods. Research published in *Sloan Management Review* indicated that remaining employees will judge a company's future interactions with them on how fairly it treats those who are let go.⁴³

Q. Are there any further reasons to offer severance pay?

A. Yes. Research published in *Business Ethics Quarterly* supports that severance packages can be seen as an ethical responsibility, ensuring that managers who have contributed to the company are supported during their transition to new employment.⁴⁴ Thus despite the pejorative characterization by Staff of "cutting off liability for business torts,"⁴⁵

RESPONDENT'S REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DR. M. PETER SCONTRINO - 20

⁴² Employee Benefits Survey, SHRM (2023).

⁴³ Mishra et al., *Sloan Management Review* (1998).

⁴⁴ Kim, T.W., Business Ethics Quarterly (2014).

⁴⁵ Sharbono, Exh. BS-1CT at 20.

severance pay's aim is characterized far more positively in peer reviewed literature. In summary, while providing severance to a fired manager is a strategic decision that can assist the employer avoid liability issues and significant costs associated therewith, it also serves to maintain a positive reputation, reassure remaining employees and ensure overall ethical treatment of employees of an organization.

VII. CONCLUSION

Q.

Does this complete your rebuttal testimony?

A. Yes it does.