

Exh. DCP-12

Dockets UE-230172 and UE-210852

Witness: David C. Parcell

**BEFORE THE WASHINGTON
UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

**WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION,**

Complainant,

v.

**PACIFICORP d/b/a PACIFIC POWER
AND LIGHT COMPANY,**

Respondent.

**DOCKETS UE-230172 and
UE-210852 (Consolidated)**

In the Matter of

**ALLIANCE OF WESTERN ENERGY
CONSUMERS'**

**Petition for Order Approving Deferral of
Increased Fly Ash Revenues**

EXHIBIT TO TESTIMONY OF

DAVID C. PARCELL

**ON BEHALF OF STAFF OF
WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

Proxy Companies - ROE and M/B

September 14, 2023

**PROXY COMPANIES
RATES OF RETURN ON AVERAGE COMMON EQUITY**

COMPANY	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2002-2008 Average	2009-2020 Average	2021	2022	2023	2024	2026-28	2021 - 2026-28 Average
Parcell Proxy Group																											
ALLETE				12.0%	13.2%	13.4%	11.4%	7.3%	8.2%	9.5%	8.7%	8.4%	8.6%	9.4%	8.3%	8.0%	8.2%	7.8%	7.7%		8.3%	7.2%	7.3%	8.0%	8.0%	9.0%	7.9%
Alliant Energy Corp	5.7%	9.1%	8.5%	10.3%	9.4%	11.5%	10.2%	7.5%	10.8%	10.4%	11.1%	11.4%	11.5%	10.6%	9.9%	11.4%	11.7%	11.5%	11.2%	9.2%	10.8%	11.3%	11.2%	10.5%	11.0%	12.0%	11.2%
Ameren Corp	10.8%	12.2%	10.0%	10.3%	8.5%	9.3%	8.8%	8.4%	8.5%	7.6%	8.0%	7.7%	8.8%	8.5%	9.3%	9.4%	10.9%	10.5%	10.3%	10.0%	9.0%	10.5%	10.6%	11.0%	11.0%	10.0%	10.6%
Avista Corp	4.5%	6.7%	4.6%	5.8%	8.8%	4.1%	7.6%	8.4%	8.5%	8.6%	6.4%	8.7%	8.1%	7.8%	8.6%	7.5%	7.8%	10.6%	6.5%	6.0%	8.1%	7.1%	6.9%	7.5%	7.5%	7.5%	7.3%
Black Hills Corp	12.1%	8.9%	7.9%	9.4%	9.6%	10.9%	0.7%	8.4%	5.9%	3.6%	7.1%	9.1%	9.6%	9.5%	8.9%	10.9%	10.2%	9.4%	9.4%	8.5%	8.5%	8.9%	9.0%	8.0%	8.0%	8.0%	8.4%
Evergy, Inc.																					7.2%	7.1%					
Eversource Energy	6.4%	7.1%	5.1%	5.4%	4.5%	8.6%	9.8%	9.6%	4.9%	10.0%	7.3%	8.3%	8.3%	8.6%	8.9%	9.0%	9.1%	9.3%	9.2%	6.7%	8.5%	9.3%	9.4%	9.5%	9.5%	10.0%	9.5%
Fortis, Inc.			10.5%	10.7%	11.3%	8.9%	8.8%	8.3%	8.6%	8.8%	8.0%	7.5%	5.8%	7.9%	6.2%	8.3%	7.6%	7.5%	7.1%	10.0%	7.6%	7.1%	7.5%	7.0%	7.0%	7.5%	7.2%
IDACORP	7.1%	4.2%	8.2%	7.3%	9.4%	7.1%	8.0%	9.3%	9.8%	10.5%	9.9%	10.1%	10.2%	9.7%	9.4%	9.6%	9.8%	9.6%	9.4%	7.3%	9.8%	9.4%	9.4%	9.0%	9.0%	9.5%	9.3%
Northwestern Corp				6.4%	6.9%	8.4%	9.4%	9.6%	9.6%	10.9%	9.3%	9.5%	10.3%	9.0%	10.0%	9.4%	9.1%	8.9%	7.9%		9.4%	8.3%	7.5%	7.0%	7.5%	8.0%	7.7%
OGE Energy	11.1%	13.2%	12.7%	12.5%	15.0%	14.7%	13.0%	12.9%	13.5%	14.0%	13.2%	12.5%	10.3%	10.0%	10.5%	10.8%	11.0%	10.7%		13.2%	11.9%	12.3%	10.7%	12.0%	12.0%	13.0%	12.0%
Otter Tail Corp	15.2%	12.0%	10.8%	11.6%	10.4%	10.4%	5.9%	3.7%	2.1%	2.7%	6.9%	9.4%	10.3%	9.9%	9.7%	10.7%	11.4%	11.5%	11.6%	10.9%	8.3%	18.9%	25.5%	13.5%	13.0%	11.5%	16.5%
Pinnacle West Capital Corp	8.6%	8.3%	8.2%	6.7%	9.2%	8.5%	6.1%	6.8%	9.3%	8.7%	9.8%	9.9%	9.2%	9.7%	9.4%	10.1%	9.9%	10.1%	9.9%	7.9%	9.4%	10.7%	8.1%	7.5%	8.0%	9.5%	8.8%
Portland General Electric						11.5%	6.5%	6.2%	8.0%	9.0%	8.3%	7.7%	9.1%	8.2%	8.3%	8.6%	8.6%	8.4%	5.9%		8.0%	9.1%	8.9%	8.0%	8.5%	9.5%	8.8%
WEC Energy Group	12.8%	11.8%	9.0%	11.6%	11.1%	11.1%	11.0%	10.8%	12.2%	13.0%	13.3%	13.6%	13.5%	10.0%	10.6%	10.8%	11.0%	11.4%	11.6%	11.2%	11.8%	12.1%	12.5%	12.5%	12.5%	13.0%	12.5%
Average	9.4%	9.4%	8.7%	9.5%	9.8%	9.8%	8.3%	8.4%	8.6%	9.1%	9.1%	9.6%	9.7%	9.2%	9.1%	9.6%	9.7%	9.6%	9.0%	9.2%	9.3%	10.1%	10.2%	9.3%	9.4%	9.9%	9.8%
Median	9.7%	9.0%	8.5%	10.3%	9.4%	9.9%	8.6%	8.4%	8.6%	9.3%	8.5%	9.3%	9.4%	9.5%	9.4%	9.5%	9.9%	9.6%	9.4%	9.3%	9.2%	9.4%	9.0%	9.0%	9.0%	9.5%	9.2%

Note -- blanks in individual years and average column indicates that Value Line annual data is not available for all years of the indicated period.

Source: Calculations made from data contained in Value Line Investment Survey.

**PROXY COMPANIES
MARKET TO BOOK RATIOS**

COMPANY	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2002-2008 Average	2009-2020 Average	2021	2022
Parcell Proxy Group																							
ALLETE				212%	219%	195%	156%	113%	127%	138%	136%	152%	151%	146%	153%	182%	181%	189%	152%		152%	145%	126%
Alliant Energy Corp	110%	97%	120%	131%	155%	173%	131%	103%	131%	147%	161%	169%	197%	196%	214%	235%	223%	237%	223%	131%	186%	232%	230%
Ameren Corp	163%	162%	161%	172%	164%	159%	122%	83%	81%	92%	106%	125%	152%	149%	165%	198%	202%	225%	215%	158%	149%	220%	222%
Avista Corp	85%	94%	111%	115%	135%	127%	110%	94%	106%	119%	123%	125%	143%	141%	158%	174%	178%	160%	146%	111%	139%	144%	135%
Black Hills Corp	143%	134%	134%	165%	153%	164%	124%	77%	108%	109%	121%	161%	181%	152%	186%	207%	174%	191%	171%	145%	153%	156%	158%
Evergy, Inc.																		159%	155%		164%	155%	
Eversource Energy	99%	95%	106%	108%	131%	163%	128%	114%	136%	150%	143%	141%	158%	158%	166%	175%	173%	201%	202%	119%	160%	203%	190%
Fortis, Inc.			165%	192%	210%	187%	146%	139%	150%	161%	172%	150%	149%	143%	133%	139%	130%	142%	138%	180%	146%	149%	154%
IDACORP	134%	112%	125%	122%	139%	132%	104%	94%	113%	119%	123%	136%	159%	158%	177%	203%	199%	212%	183%	124%	156%	192%	196%
Northwestern Corp					160%	147%	109%	105%	122%	138%	146%	159%	174%	167%	171%	169%	154%	170%	154%		152%	147%	127%
OGE Energy	147%	154%	178%	187%	205%	197%	145%	139%	180%	197%	204%	231%	228%	184%	170%	192%	181%	206%	179%	173%	191%	176%	180%
Otter Tail Corp	245%	209%	185%	183%	178%	200%	167%	108%	120%	123%	152%	196%	196%	186%	207%	244%	253%	274%	217%	195%	190%	248%	255%
Pinnacle West Capital Corp	116%	114%	130%	130%	129%	127%	100%	90%	113%	125%	141%	153%	158%	160%	172%	191%	182%	191%	169%	121%	154%	148%	132%
Portland General Electric					153%	140%	101%	83%	97%	109%	117%	131%	145%	148%	155%	173%	162%	179%	163%		139%	158%	161%
WEC Energy Group	129%	147%	156%	168%	182%	179%	153%	147%	171%	186%	213%	223%	249%	219%	209%	217%	220%	26%	272%	159%	196%	266%	265%
Average	137%	132%	143%	157%	165%	164%	128%	106%	125%	137%	147%	161%	174%	165%	174%	193%	187%	184%	183%	147%	162%	183%	179%
Median	132%	124%	134%	167%	158%	164%	126%	104%	121%	132%	142%	153%	159%	158%	171%	192%	181%	191%	171%	143%	156%	164%	161%

Note -- blanks in individual years and average column indicates that Value Line annual data is not available for all years of the indicated period.

Source: Calculations made from data contained in Value Line Investment Survey.

**WITNESS BULKLEY PROXY GROUP
RETURNS ON EQUITY AND MARKET-TO-BOOK RATIOS**

Company	Actual ROE (Average Equity)		Projected ROE (Value Line)			M/B
	2021	2022	2023	2024	2026-28	2022
Bulkley Proxy Group						
ALLETE, Inc.	7.2%	7.3%	8.0%	8.0%	9.0%	126%
Alliant Energy Corp	11.2%	10.5%	11.0%	12.0%	11.2%	230%
Ameren Corp	10.5%	10.6%	11.0%	11.0%	10.0%	222%
American Electric Power Corp	11.6%	11.2%	10.0%	10.0%	11.0%	204%
Avista Corp	6.9%	7.5%	7.5%	7.5%	7.3%	135%
CMS Energy	12.5%	12.5%	12.0%	13.0%	14.0%	278%
Duke Energy Corp.	8.6%	8.6%	9.0%	9.0%	9.0%	163%
Entergy Corp.	12.3%	9.0%	9.0%	9.0%	8.5%	187%
Evergy, Inc.	7.9%	9.0%	9.0%	10.0%	9.1%	155%
IDACORP, Inc.	9.4%	9.0%	9.0%	9.5%	9.3%	196%
NextEra Energy, Inc.	13.0%	15.0%	14.0%	14.5%	14.5%	416%
Northwestern Corp.	7.5%	7.0%	7.5%	8.0%	7.7%	180%
OGE Energy Corp.	10.7%	12.0%	12.0%	13.0%	12.0%	180%
Otter Tail Corp.	25.5%	13.5%	13.0%	11.5%	16.5%	255%
Portland General Electric Co.	8.9%	8.0%	8.5%	9.5%	8.8%	161%
Southern Co.	13.0%	13.3%	13.0%	13.0%	14.5%	261%
Xcel Energy, Inc.	10.6%	10.7%	10.5%	10.5%	11.0%	228%
Average	11.0%	10.3%	10.2%	10.5%	10.8%	210%
Median	10.6%	10.5%	10.0%	10.0%	10.0%	196%

Source: Calculations from data contained in Value Line Investment Survey.