

**BEFORE THE WASHINGTON
UTILITIES & TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION,

Complainant,

v.

PUGET SOUND ENERGY,

Respondent.

DOCKET UG-230393

**CROSS-EXAMINATION EXHIBIT OF RONALD J. ROBERTS
ON BEHALF OF THE
PUYALLUP TRIBE OF INDIANS**

EXHIBIT RJR-__X

Excerpt of Testimony of Matthew Stobart, CB&I for PSE, PCHB No. P19-087C
(Apr. 22, 2021)

October 31, 2023

POLLUTION CONTROL HEARINGS BOARD
FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON

ADVOCATES FOR A CLEANER TACOMA;)	
SIERRA CLUB; WASHINGTON)	
ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL; WASHINGTON)	
PHYSICIANS FOR SOCIAL)	PCHB NO. P19-087C
RESPONSIBILITY; STAND.EARTH; and)	
THE PUYALLUP TRIBE OF INDIANS,)	
)	
Appellants,)	
)	
v.)	
)	
PUGET SOUND CLEAN AIR AGENCY, PUGET)	
SOUND ENERGY,)	
)	
Respondents.)	

VIDEOCONFERENCE HEARING

DAY 8

Pages 1751 - 2048

OLYMPIA, WASHINGTON

April 22, 2021

8:46 a.m.

REPORTED BY: CRYSTAL R. McAULIFFE, RPR, CCR 2121

Page 1752

1 A P P E A R A N C E S
2 FOR THE POLLUTION CONTROL HEARINGS BOARD:

3
4 HEATHER C. FRANCKS, AAJ
5 NEIL L. WISE, BOARD CHAIR
6 CAROLINA SUN-WIDROW, BOARD MEMBER
7 MICHELLE GONZALEZ, BOARD MEMBER
8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND LAND USE
9 HEARINGS OFFICE
10 PO Box 40903
11 Olympia, WA 98504-0903
12 eluho@eluhho.wa.gov

13
14 FOR APPELLANTS ADVOCATES FOR A CLEANER TACOMA; SIERRA
15 CLUB; WASHINGTON ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL; WASHINGTON
16 PHYSICIANS FOR SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY; STAND.EARTH:

17 JAN E. HASSELMAN
18 JAIMINI PAREKH
19 EARTHJUSTICE
20 810 Third Avenue
21 Suite 610
22 Seattle, Washington 98104
23 (206) 343-7340
24 jhasselman@earthjustice.org
25 jparekh@earthjustice.org

FOR APPELLANT THE PUYALLUP TRIBE OF INDIANS:

17 GEOFF J.M. BRIDGMAN
18 NICHOLAS G. THOMAS
19 BRIAN S. EPLEY
20 ANDREW S. FULLER
21 OGDEN MURPHY WALLACE, PLLC
22 901 5th Ave, Suite 3500
23 Seattle, WA 98164
24 (206) 447-7000
25 gbridgman@omwlaw.com
bepley@omwlaw.com
nthomas@omwlaw.com
afuller@omwlaw.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued)

FOR RESPONDENT PUGET SOUND ENERGY:

TADAS A. KISIELIUS
SARA A. LEVERETTE
VAN NESS FELDMAN LLP
1191 Second Avenue, Suite 1800
Seattle, WA 98101
(206) 623-9372
tak@vnf.com
sleverette@vnf.com

JOSHUA B. FRANK
ALLISON WATKINS MALLICK
STERLING MARCHAND
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.
700 K Street NW
Washington, D.C. 20001
(202) 639-7700
joshua.frank@bakerbotts.com
allison.mallick@bakerbotts.com
sterling.marchand@bakerbotts.com

FOR RESPONDENT PUGET SOUND CLEAR AIR AGENCY:

JENNIFER A. DOLD
JENNIFER ELIAS
PUGET SOUND CLEAN AIR AGENCY
1904 3rd Avenue
Suite 105
Seattle, Washington 98101-3317
(206) 343-8800
jenniferd@psccleanair.gov
jennifere@psccleanair.gov

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Page 1754

1 VIDEOCONFERENCE HEARING
2 DAY 8
3 April 22, 2021

4	Witnesses:	Page
5	WILLIAM DONAHUE	
6	By Mr. Marchand	1790
	By Mr. Epley	1817
7	By Board Member Sun-Widrow	1820
8	STEVEN VAN SLYKE	
9	By Ms. Dold	1822
	By Mr. Thomas	1961
10	By Ms. Dold	1981
	By Board Chair Wise	1982
11	By Board Member Gonzalez	1986
	By Ms. Dold	1987
12	By Mr. Frank	1988
13	MATTHEW STOBART	
14	By Mr. Frank	1990

15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Page 2038

1 Q. Okay. And we didn't talk about this
2 specifically, but each waste gas case has the
3 composition of the gases that would go to the flare in
4 those cases; is that right?

5 A. That's correct, yes.

6 Q. Did CB&I ever communicate directly with the
7 Agency?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Let's talk a little bit about the bypass, which
10 you -- you showed in your -- your talk on the video that
11 little pipe at the top of flare that you call it the
12 diversion vent.

13 What -- what is the purpose of the diversion
14 vent?

15 A. It's a safety device. It's -- it's there to
16 prevent you from blocking in those headers, because
17 basically you don't want to keep pouring gas into the
18 flare if it is not lit. If you have a failure of the
19 flare or a flame-out, some other type of failure like an
20 electrical failure, then you don't have combustion going
21 on any more in the flare. And it is dangerous to put
22 gas in there so we don't. It diverts. A couple of
23 valves open up at that point and the gas diverts up to
24 the vent.

25 Q. Okay. So how is it actually triggered?

1 A. It's in the event of a failure. If the -- if
2 the detectors on the -- on the unit no longer detect a
3 flame, that's one form of failure. There are some other
4 forms of failure. But if you have a shutdown of the
5 flare, that's -- that will open up the diversion vents.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. Or diversion vent.

8 Q. And so the valves to the diversion vent, are
9 those open or closed when the flare is operating?

10 A. They are closed when the flare is operating
11 normally.

12 Q. And what does that mean to be closed?

13 A. It means there's no gas going through them.
14 There's no gas going up through the vent.

15 Q. Okay. And if the vents are opened, and in the
16 case of the failure that you are just talking about, are
17 there methods for reducing how much gas goes out of that
18 diversion vent?

19 A. Yes. The operating procedures for the facility
20 are written such that the operators have to take
21 immediate actions of flare failure. The first thing
22 that they do is reduce the waste gas flows from the
23 liquefier. They may try to re-light the -- the -- the
24 flare. If they can't get it re-lit, they will
25 immediately shut down the liquefier. And it probably

Page 2040

1 takes a couple of minutes. They will reduce the waste
2 gas flows within seconds. It's a couple of set-points
3 on the -- on the -- that the operator adjusts, but yeah.

4 Q. Sorry. You said the process to shut down just
5 takes a couple minutes?

6 A. Yes. We think the liquefier would be shut
7 down -- if you can't get the flare re-lit, the liquefier
8 is shut down, I would say, within five minutes. The
9 waste gas flows are reduced to kind of a trickle within,
10 probably, one minute. The -- the liquefier can be shut
11 down within about five minutes. And then all of the
12 rest of the waste gas flow rates, like the chromatograph
13 speed loops and the -- the compressor seals that also go
14 to the flare, those can also be shut off within ten
15 minutes of the initial failure of the flare.

16 Q. Okay. And so in paragraph 47 of his pre-filed
17 testimony, Dr. Sahu calculates emissions from a single
18 day of emissions bypassing the flare.

19 Is that a situation that can occur?

20 A. No. That's -- that's never going to happen.
21 First of all, it's a gross permit violation.
22 But no, the operating procedures instruct the operators
23 exactly what to do, and there's no way it runs for very
24 long through that vent.

25 Q. Okay. Could you just talk a little bit about

1 the backup systems that are in place to ensure that the
2 flare will not go out?

3 A. Yes. The -- the flare is -- one of the things
4 is the electrical system is fed from an uninterruptible
5 power supply, which is a battery backed-up power supply.
6 The same power supply that supplies power to all the
7 control systems throughout the whole facility and all
8 the security systems for the facility and the hazard
9 detection devices, they are all battery backed up and
10 they would never lose power.

11 Q. Okay. How often would the bypass be expected to
12 be used once the facility begins normal operations?

13 A. I hope it never gets used. But it's a safety
14 device, just like release valves are a safety device.
15 They are there in case you need them. But we hope that
16 it never gets used. It might get used over a couple
17 times over the lifetime of the facility.

18 Q. So yeah, can we pull up PSE 0069. Take a look
19 at that real quick. A little non-sequitur.

20 A. You are going to display it?

21 MR. FRANK: Yes. Mr. Holtzen, can you just
22 scroll through this a little bit so Mr. Stobart can see
23 it?

24 THE WITNESS: Yes. These are the vendor
25 drawings from LFG. And this is basically the general