

TI 739
EXCEPTION 3086—DISPOSITION REPORT
Qwest OSS Evaluation

Initial Release Date: November 26, 2001
First Response Date: March 7, 2002
Second Response Date: March 25, 2002
Disposition Report Release Date: April 5, 2002 (rescinded)
Third Supplemental Response Date: April 12, 2002
Fourth Supplemental Response Date: April 12, 2002
Disposition Report: April 22, 2002

EXCEPTION DISPOSITION REPORT

Exception:

Qwest did not install non-dispatch orders for the P-CLEC within a time period that is in parity with Qwest's retail operations, as measured by the PID OP-4C.

Summary of Exception:

For the PID OP-4C, Qwest did not achieve the expected results for the Dual Test for Residential POTS and UNE-P in all three regions, and for Business POTS in the Eastern and Western region.

The following table shows the average installation interval for the P-CLEC and for the Qwest retail comparative.

Average Installation Interval for Failing Products and Regions

Product	Region	P-CLEC Average Days	Qwest Retail Comparative Days
Residential POTS	Eastern	4.4	1.5
Residential POTS	Central	2.5	1.9
Residential POTS	Western	2.8	1.7
Business POTS	Eastern	3.8	1.5
Business POTS	Western	2.7	1.6
UNE-P	Eastern	4.9	1.5
UNE-P	Central	2.8	1.9
UNE-P	Western	3.3	1.7

As shown by the table and confirmed by the Dual Test, Qwest did not provide the required parity service for this PID.

Summary of Qwest's First Response:

Qwest understands that KPMG has begun retesting this Exception in accordance with the Executive Committee's decision on 12/21/01 which supports using the 3.0 PID to

TI 739
EXCEPTION 3086—DISPOSITION REPORT
 Qwest OSS Evaluation

evaluate results of testing to date and that re-testing should be measured by the most recent PID changes approved by the TAG at the time the re-testing starts.

When the April 2000 Version 3.0 PID was approved, Qwest did not have the measurement capability to allow the comparison of like services. Therefore it was commonly understood that as that capability became available, Qwest would enhance their systems and measurements to allow the comparison of like services.

The use of PID 4.0 for retesting should, in itself, improve the results of OP-4C for the three products subject to this Exception. However, there is a possibility of negative results for OP-4C in one or more regions for one or more of these products, due only to the way OP-4C results are calculated and not due to non-discriminatory actions by Qwest. Qwest has made proposals to the TAG to improve OP-4C calculations, and those proposals are still under discussion with the TAG.

KPMG Consulting’s Retest Results:

As a result of this exception, a retest was performed for Resale Residence, Resale Business and UNE-P in all regions where Qwest failed the original test. The retest results indicate that Qwest is now passing OP-4 for Resale Residence in all regions, and for Resale Business in the Western Region, but failing for Resale Business in the Eastern Region, and failing UNE-P for all three regions. The results are summarized in the table below. Note that the analysis was performed using January retail data, and that February retail data is required to complete the analysis. After obtaining February retail data from Qwest, KPMG Consulting will re-analyze the data, and will document any changes in the results that may occur.

In the table below, the test result is given, along with the P-CLEC and retail averages and counts. In addition, the Dual Test Hypothesis Test Mean is given. This is the value compared against in the second of the Dual Tests.

OP-4 Retest Results

Product	Region	Overall Result	First Dual Test p-value	Second Dual Test p-value	P-CLEC Average Days	Retail Average Days (January 2002)	P-CLEC Count	Retail Count	Dual Test Hypothesis Test Mean
Residence POTS	Eastern	Pass	0.3921	0.0000	2.4	2.3	150	20,465	1.9
Business POTS	Eastern	Fail	0.0000	0.9888	2.2	1.3	145	670	1.7
UNE-P	Eastern	Fail	0.0070	0.6281	2.8	2.3	145	21,135	2.3
Residence POTS	Central	Pass	0.9567	0.0000	2.3	2.4	137	33,785	1.8
Business POTS	Central	Not retested							
UNE-P	Central	Fail	0.0239	0.0600	2.6	2.4	140	33,785	2.2
Residence POTS	Western	Pass	0.9971	0.0000	2.4	2.6	143	34,739	1.9
Business POTS	Western	Pass	0.0824	0.0067	2.5	2.2	160	1,225	1.8
UNE-P	Western	Fail	0.0058	0.5586	2.9	2.6	141	35,964	2.6

TI 739
EXCEPTION 3086—DISPOSITION REPORT
 Qwest OSS Evaluation

Summary of Qwest's Second Response:

As a result of this exception, Qwest identified a reporting anomaly with respect to the calculation of the retail and Residence Resale results for the OP 4C PID. Qwest has corrected the data problem and has recast the December and January results with the production of the February results for this PID. Qwest believes the reporting anomaly caused the disparate results. Qwest requests KPMG review and analyze the revised results associated with this exception.

Summary of KPMG Consulting's PID Recalculation Results:

KPMG Consulting has received February data and an update for January, with major changes to the retail intervals. KPMG Consulting has not audited these changes, but is using them in the re-analysis shown here as requested by Qwest in its reply comments of 3/19/01.

In the table below, the test result is given, along with the P-CLEC and retail averages and counts. In addition, the Dual Test Hypothesis Test Mean is given. This is the value compared against in the second of the Dual Tests. Based on these results, Qwest is still failing Business POTs in the Eastern Region, but is now passing UNE-P as well as the other products in all regions.

OP-4 Retest Results Using Recast Retail Data

OP-4

Product	Region	P-CLEC Average Days	Retail Average Days (January 2002)	P-CLEC Count	First Test p-value	Second Dual Test p-value	Overall Result	Retail Count	Dual Test Hypothesis Test Mean
Residence POTS	Eastern	2.4	2.7	150	0.9999	0.0000	Pass	38,726	1.9
Residence POTS	Central	2.3	2.8	137	1.0000	0.0000	Pass	62,240	1.9
Residence POTS	Western	2.4	3.1	143	1.0000	0.0000	Pass	67,006	1.9
Business POTS	Eastern	2.2	1.5	145	0.0001	0.8315	Fail	1,110	1.7
Business POTS	Central						Not retested	2,427	
Business POTS	Western	2.5	2.2	160	0.0913	0.0041	Pass	2,338	1.8
UNE-P	Eastern	2.8	2.7	145	0.2467	0.0000	Pass	39,836	2.3
UNE-P	Central	2.6	2.8	140	0.9618	0.0000	Pass	64,667	2.2
UNE-P	Western	2.9	3.1	141	0.8357	0.0000	Pass	69,344	2.4

KPMG Consulting requests that Qwest provide more specifics about the nature of the reporting anomaly and the associated correction that produced these revised results.

TI 739
EXCEPTION 3086—DISPOSITION REPORT
 Qwest OSS Evaluation

Additionally, KPMG Consulting would like to know if the new reporting process and results have been or will be audited by Liberty Consulting.

Summary of Qwest’s Third Response:

The reporting anomaly Qwest described in its 3/18/02 response affected the reporting of non-dispatch residential resale and retail orders for which the installation interval included a Saturday. Saturday was being counted as a business day for these types of orders, and included in the installation interval calculation, only if the due date fell on Saturday.

In addition, subsequent to 3/18/02, Qwest identified a calculation error that affected reporting for wholesale and retail orders with a Saturday or Sunday APP date. For these orders, regulatory reporting for OP-4 was including one additional business day in the interval calculation. In the recast data, the calculation has been corrected accordingly for these orders except where orders should count Saturday as a business day (non-dispatch residential resale and retail orders) as described in the first paragraph of this response.

Qwest provided KPMG a recast OP-4 data set for January and February on 4/01/02. While Qwest understands that KPMG will need to analyze the recast data set, Qwest believes that the revised results demonstrate that Qwest is meeting all OP-4 PID sub-measurements, with the exception of Eastern Region Resale Business POTs . Qwest requests that KPMG not retest for Eastern Region Resale Business POTs, as Qwest will rely upon its commercial results to prove parity for this product in its filings for the Eastern Region States. Accordingly, Qwest requests that KPMG Consulting close this exception as “closed/unresolved” for Eastern Region Resale Business POTs. Pursuant to KPMG’s 3/25/02 response, Qwest also requested that Liberty review and analyze the revised results associated with the recast data set. Liberty indicated that it would complete this review no later than 4/10/02.

KPMG Consulting’s 04/05/02 Disposition Report:

The results of KPMG Consulting’s reanalysis of the OP-4 results using the second recast of the Qwest retail data are shown in the table below.

OP-4 Retest Results Using Second Recast of Retail Data

OP-4		P-CLEC Average Days	Retail Average Days (January 2002)	P-CLEC Count	First Dual Test p-value	Second Dual Test p-value	Overall Result	Retail Count	Dual Test Hypothesis Test Mean
Product	Region								
Residence POTS	Eastern	2.4	2.6	150	0.9941	0.0000	Pass	36,706	1.9
Residence POTS	Central	2.3	2.9	137	1.0000	0.0000	Pass	80,458	1.9
Residence POTS	Western	2.4	2.8	143	1.0000	0.0000	Pass	54,998	1.9
Business POTS	Eastern	2.2	1.5	145	0.0001	0.8183	Fail	1,270	1.7

TI 739
EXCEPTION 3086—DISPOSITION REPORT
 Qwest OSS Evaluation

Business POTS	Central						Not retested	3,247	
Business POTS	Western	2.5	2.2	160	0.0727	0.0090	Pass	2,410	1.8
UNE-P	Eastern	2.8	2.6	145	0.0712	0.0031	Pass	37,976	2.3
UNE-P	Central	2.6	2.9	140	0.9939	0.0000	Pass	83,705	2.2
UNE-P	Western	2.9	2.8	141	0.2062	0.0002	Pass	57,408	2.4

This fresh look at the PID performance using the corrected data shows that the overall results for this PID have not changed. Qwest is passing the OP-4 requirement for all products except Resale Business in the Eastern Region.

KPMG Consulting acknowledges Qwest’s reply comments explaining the cause of the data anomalies and the re-audit of the revised data by Liberty Consulting. KPMG Consulting has opened Exception 3120 to address this and other data integrity issues originally addressed in Observations 3089 and 3099.

This Disposition report was rescinded on 4/12/02 at the direction of the TAG.

Summary of KPMG Consulting’s Fourth Response:

The results shown in KPMG Consulting’s 4/5/02 Disposition Report were the subject of a lengthy discussion during the 4/11/02 TAG call. There was a concern that the results shown for UNE-P were not a true parity comparison with retail results because of the manner in which the weekends were treated in the retail data as compared to the P-CLEC data. For the retail residential analog, Saturdays were counted as part of the interval. However, for UNE-P, Saturdays were not counted when these orders were issued, per the published Qwest Standard Interval Guide. To adjust for this mismatch and make the comparison more like-for-like, the TAG instructed KPMG Consulting to revisit its analysis using only retail Business POTS data as the analog for UNE-P results. The outcome of this fresh look at the results are shown on the table below:

OP-4 Retest Results Reflecting Second Recast of Retail Data and Using Business POTS as the UNE-P Analog

OP-4

Product	Region	P-CLEC Average Days	Retail Average Days	P-CLEC Count	First Dual Test p-value	Second Dual Test p-value	Overall Result	Retail Count	Dual Test Hypothesis Test Mean
Residence POTS	Eastern	2.4	2.6	150	0.9941	0.0000	Pass	36,706	1.9
Residence POTS	Central	2.3	2.9	137	1.0000	0.0000	Pass	80,458	1.9
Residence POTS	Western	2.4	2.8	143	1.0000	0.0000	Pass	54,998	1.9
Business POTS	Eastern	2.2	1.5	145	0.0001	0.8183	Fail	1,270	1.7
Business POTS	Central						Not retested	3,247	
Business POTS	Western	2.5	2.2	160	0.0727	0.0090	Pass	2,410	1.8
UNE-P	Eastern	2.8	1.5	145	0.0000	1.0000	Fail	1,270	2.2
UNE-P	Central	2.6	2.1	140	0.0058	0.5471	Fail	3,247	2.1

TI 739
EXCEPTION 3086—DISPOSITION REPORT
Qwest OSS Evaluation

UNE-P	Western	2.9	2.2	141	0.0021	0.6430	Fail	2,410	2.3
-------	---------	-----	-----	-----	--------	--------	------	-------	-----

Summary of Qwest’s Fourth Response:

Although KPMG’s recast OP-4C data indicates that UNE-P failed the dual test analysis, Qwest believes that its commercial results for OP-4C beginning with March 2002 data will validate that the average installation interval for non-dispatch wholesale orders is in parity with Qwest’s retail comparative.

Qwest requests KPMG to close this exception as “closed/unresolved” for Eastern Region Resale Business POTS and for UNE-P in all three regions.

Disposition Report (04/22/02):

Based on Qwest’s April 19 response, KPMG Consulting recommends that Exception 3086 be “closed/unresolved.”