Docket No. UT-063038

Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson

Page 1

Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006

WUTC Docket No. UT-063038 ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests And Requests for Admissions October 27, 2006

<u>Data Request No. 1.</u> Identify all specific services offered by Eschelon to ISP that serve end user customers in Washington. Provide a narrative description of each such service.

OBJECTION: ATI objects to this request on the basis that it is vague, ambiguous overly broad and seeks information that is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. Without waiving its objections, ATI provides the following response:

RESPONSE: ATI has no ISP-specific products. All ATI products are available to ISPs, although ATI does not actively market its services to wholesale providers such as ISPs. Eschelon has no ISP-specific products and has a policy against selling Internet T-1s to wholesale ISPs. A description of all ATI services is on the Eschelon website at www.eschelon.com/voice/index.aspx.

Responsible Person: Mary Korthour

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 2

WUTC Docket No. UT-063038 ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests And Requests for Admissions October 27, 2006

Data Request No. 2. Does Eschelon provide a service or services in Washington for ISPs (e.g., AOL, Earthlink, MSN, or other smaller local or regional ISPs serving Washington customers) whereby Eschelon provides *any* of the following service components related to dial-up Internet access: (1) local telephone numbers for your ISP customers to provide to their end users for access to the Internet; (2) transport from the local calling area ("LCA") (as defined by the WUTC) of the ISP end user customer to the point of points of interconnection ("POIs") of Eschelon in Washington; (3) authentication of the calling party on behalf of your ISP customer; or (4) the provision of the initial modem functionality on behalf of the ISP customer(s) whereby the protocol conversion between the analog, time division multiplexing ("TDM") signals sent by the ISP end user are converted to Internet Protocol ("IP") (and vice versa) in order to allow the ISP's end user access to and the ability to communicate with the Internet.

If Eschelon provides any such components:

- a. Identify each component of each such service offered by Eschelon to ISPs that provide service to Washington customers.
- b. Identify all components of the service or services that provide telecommunications functionalities to ISPs. For each such component, identify the terms and conditions, including price, under which such services are offered or provided in Washington.
- c. Identify by web page address and name of service all web pages of your company's website that describe such services offered by you.

OBJECTION: ATI objects to this request on the basis that it is vague, ambiguous overly broad and seeks information that is not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. Specifically, the request uses the terms "service," "services" and "service components" without providing a definition. Without waiving its objections, ATI provides the following response:

RESPONSE: ATI provides the same services to ISPs that it provides to its other customers, including such "components" as assigning local numbers and providing transport as well as all other services, and their components if ordered. Such services would potentially include all components of all services provided by ATI. Eschelon has

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006

Page 3

WUTC Docket No. UT-063038 ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests And Requests for Admissions October 27, 2006

no special or unique ISP services and does not provide modem functionality. There are

no particular or special components associated with ISP number assignment and

Eschelon has no terms or conditions or web page specific to ISP number assignment.

Eschelon assigns numbers to any ISP that gets service from Eschelon in the same manner

as it assigns numbers to non-ISP customers. Eschelon's website describing such ATI

services can be found at: http://www.eschelon.com/voice/index.aspx

Responsible Person: Mary Korthour

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson

Exhibit LLB-21

November 20, 2006

Page 4

WUTC Docket No. UT-063038 ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests And Requests for Admissions October 27, 2006

<u>Data Request No.</u> 3. If Eschelon obtains local telephone numbers from NANPA in Washington that are provided to ISPs, identify all specific NPA/NXXs obtained by Eschelon where some or all of the numbers related to that specific NPA/NXX are

provided to ISPs.

OBJECTION: ATI objects to this request on the basis that it is vague, ambiguous

overly broad and seeks information that is not reasonably calculated to lead to the

discovery of admissible evidence. Furthermore, the request is unduly burdensome and

overly broad because it does not specify a time period and it assumes that ATI knows

which of its customers are ISPs. Without waiving its objections, ATI provides the

following response:

RESPONSE: ATI has obtained the phone numbers on the attached Confidential

table from NANPA, in Washington. The NPA-NXX are the first six digits. It is possible

that some telephone numbers related to these NPA-NXX are presently provided to ISPs.

ATI has not done a study to determine which numbers are provided to ISPs.

[Confidential table redacted]

Responsible Person:

David Frame

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 5

REQUESTS FOR ADMISSION

<u>Request for Admission No. 1</u>. Admit that in Washington Eschelon obtains local telephone numbers from NANPA that it provides to its ISP customers.

RESPONSE: Eschelon admits that it obtains local telephone numbers from NANPA and that it provides such numbers to its customers, including any customers that are ISPs.

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 WUTC Docket No. UT-063038 ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests November 20, 2006 **And Requests for Admissions** October 27, 2006

Page 6

Request for Admission No. 2. Admit that in Washington Eschelon provides local telephone numbers to its ISP customers, and that such ISP customers provide to their end user customers to obtain access to the Internet through their ISP.

RESPONSE: ATI assumes that some of its customers in Washington are ISP customers. To the extent that ATI provides local telephone numbers to its ISP customers we would expect that those ISPs will use the numbers provided to them by ATI.

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 7

<u>Request for Admission No. 3.</u> Admit that in Washington Eschelon provides a service to ISPs that includes local telephone numbers obtained by Eschelon from NANPA.

RESPONSE: To the extent that any of ATI's customers in Washington are ISPs, services provided to them would include local telephone numbers obtained by ATI from NANPA, as would services to any other ATI customer.

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 8

WUTC Docket No. UT-063038 ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests And Requests for Admissions October 27, 2006

<u>Request for Admission No.</u> 4. Admit that in Washington Eschelon provides a service to ISPs that includes transport of ISP traffic to the location of the ISP equipment (whether owned by the ISP or provided by Eschelon that answers the ISP call.

RESPONSE: Eschelon admits that it provides services that may be used by ISPs in the manner described in Request for Admission No. 4, but asserts that it does not actively market services to ISP customers and that it does not have services that are unique to ISPs.

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 9

Request for Admission No. 7. Admit that in Washington Eschelon bills Qwest for termination of all ISP calls at \$.0007 per minute without regard to the physical location of the calling party and the physical location of the equipment that answers the call on behalf of the ISP and that provides the TDS-IP conversion function throughout the course of the of the ISP call.

RESPONSE: ATI denies that it bills Qwest \$0.0007 per minute or that Qwest

pays Eschelon \$0.0007 per minute for any type of traffic.

Docket No. UT-063038
Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson
Exhibit LLB-21
November 20, 2006
Page 10

<u>Request for Admission No. 8.</u> Admit that in Washington Eschelon obtains local telephone numbers from NANPA that it provides to its non-ISP customers.

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 11

<u>Request for Admission No. 9.</u> Admit that in Washington Eschelon provides on occasion local telephone numbers to non-ISP customers even though such non-ISP customers are not physically located in the same LCA with which the telephone numbers are associated.

Docket No. UT-063038 Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson Exhibit LLB-21 November 20, 2006 Page 12

Request for Admission No. 10. Admit that in Washington Eschelon on occasion provides local telephone numbers to non-ISP customers, even though such non-ISP customers are not physically located in the same LCA with which the telephone numbers are associated, and that such non-ISP customers of Eschelon provide those telephone numbers to customers located in the LCA associated with the numbers in order to allow them to call the customer of Eschelon on a toll-free basis.

WUTC Docket No. UT-063038
WUTC Docket No. UT-063038
ATI Response to Qwest's First Set of Data Requests
And Requests for Admissions
October 27, 2006

Direct Testimony of Larry B. Brotherson
Exhibit LLB-21
November 20, 2006
Page 13

Request for Admission No. 11. Admit that in Washington some portion of the reciprocal compensation bills that Eschelon renders to Qwest represent traffic that originates in one LCA and terminates with non-ISP customers of Eschelon that are physically located in a LCA different than the LCA of the calling party.