## BEFORE THE WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Petition of:

**QWEST CORPORATION** 

To Initiate a Mass-Market Switching and Dedicated Transport Case Pursuant to the Triennial Review Order CASE CAPTION Docket No. UT-033044

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA [November 14, 2003]

- 1. The Washington Electronic Business and Telecommunications Coalition ("WeBTEC") does not object to the Motion of Advanced TelCom, Inc., Eschelon Telecom of Washington, Inc., Integra Telecom of Washington, Inc., Global Crossing Local Services, Inc., McLeodUSA Telecommunications, Inc., Pac-West Telecomm, Inc., Time Warner Telecom of Washington, LLC, and XO Washington, Inc. (collectively "Joint CLECs") for Anonymous Disclosure of CLEC Data ("Motion"), insofar as the motion seeks only to mask the identities of the CLECs providing information and provided that the raw data, with the CLEC identities masked and without aggregation, are available to the representatives and witnesses of other parties who have signed the Highly Confidential Protective Order.
- 2. It is essential that all parties have access to all information that is necessary to enable them to evaluate the evidence and fully litigate the issues in this case. It is improper to

give favored access to data to the Staff, without giving the same access to data to the other

litigants. As this Commission has noted a number of time, including today in an order issued in

UT-031472: "In formal proceedings, such as this case, the Commission's regulatory staff

functions as an independent party with the same right, privileges, and responsibilities as any other

party to the proceeding. There is an "ex parte wall" separating the Commissioners, the presiding

ALJ, and the Commissioners' policy and accounting advisors from all parties, including Staff.

RCW 34.05.455." Since Staff is just another party litigant, with its own agenda, it would be both

a violation of basic due process and a disservice to the Commission and the public to restrict

access to data to just that one party. As demonstrated clearly in the recent Qwest business

exchange service competitive classification proceeding, UT-030614, relying on one party to

aggregate data and make only that aggregated data available to other parties will only lead to

confusion.

3. In their Motion, the Joint CLECs ask the Commission to establish a procedure

whereby CLECs may submit highly confidential responses to bench or data requests to the

Commission or Commission Staff, who would make that information available to parties entitled

to review highly confidential information without identifying the individual CLECs that provided

the information. As noted above, WeBTEC does not object to this request so long as the only

manipulation of the data by the Staff is to make the identity of the specific responding CLECs.

WeBTEC notes, however, that it may become necessary to follow-up on the information

submitted by particular CLECs to fully understand just what services they are providing or what

the capabilities of the equipment they are using really are. In such cases, it will be necessary to

know the identity of the responding CLECs so that further discovery may be conducted.

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA (UT-033044) - Page 2 233015 1.DOC

## RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 14th day of November, 2003.

ATER WYNNE, LLP

By

Arthur A. Butler, WSBA #04678 601 Union Street, Suite 5450 Seattle, Washington 98101-2327

Tel: (206) 623-4711 Fax: (206) 467-8406

Email: aab@aterwynne.com

Attorneys for WeBTEC

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this 14th day of November, 2003, served the true and correct original, along with the correct number of copies, of the foregoing document upon the WUTC, via the method(s) noted below, properly addressed as follows:

Carole Washburn Executive Secretary Washington Utilities and Transportation Commission	Hand Delivered  X U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 586-1150
1300 S Evergreen Park Drive SW Olympia, WA 98504-7250	Email (records@wutc.wa.gov)
copy of the foregoing document upon parties of recaddressed as follows:	f November, 2003, served a true and correct cord, via the method(s) noted below, properly
On Behalf Of AT&T:  Rebecca B. DeCook AT&T Communications 1875 Lawrence Street, Suite 1575 Denver CO 80202  Confidentiality Status: Highly Confidential	Hand Delivered  U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (303) 298-6301  Email (decook@att.com)
On Behalf Of AT&T:  Adam Walczak AT&T Communications 1875 Lawrence Street, Suite 1575 Denver CO 80202  Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (303) 298-6301 Email (awalczak@att.com)
On Behalf Of AT&T:  Mary Taylor AT&T Government Affairs 2120 Caton Way SW, Suite B Olympia WA 98502-1106  Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 705-4177 Email (marymtaylor@att.com)

On Behalf Of AT&T:	
Cathy L. Brightwell AT&T Government Affairs 2120 Caton Way SW, Suite B Olympia WA 98502-1106 Confidentiality Status: Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 705-4177 Email (brightwell@att.com)
On Behalf Of Advanced TelCom:	
Victor A. Allums GE Business Productivity Solutions, Inc. 6540 Powers Ferry Road Atlanta GA 30339 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (770) 644-7752 Email (vic.allums@ge.com)
On Behalf Of Advanced TelCom:  Meredith H. Gifford GE Business Productivity Solutions, Inc. 6540 Powers Ferry Road Atlanta GA 30339  Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (770) 644-7752 Email (meredith.gifford@ge.com)
On Behalf Of Advanced Telecom, Eschelon, Glob Crossing, etc:  Gregory J. Kopta Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1501 4th Avenue, Suite 2600 Seattle WA 98101-1688  Confidentiality Status: Highly Confidential	Hand Delivered  U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (206) 628-7699  Email (gregkopta@dwt.com)
On Behalf Of Allegiance:	
Mark A. Stachiw Allegiance Telecom 9201 North Central Expressway Dallas TX 75231 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (469) 259-9122 X Email (mark.stachiw@algx.com)
Conjiaentiality Status: Public	

On Behalf Of Allegiance:	
Jeffrey J. Binder Allegiance Telecom 1919 M Street NW, Suite 420 Washington DC 20036 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered  V.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (202) 464-0762  Email (jeff.binder@algx.com)
On Behalf Of Commission:	
Ann E. Rendahl ALJ Washington Utilities and Transportation Commission 1300 S Evergreen Park Drive SW PO Box 47250 Olympia WA 98504-7250	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 586-8203 Email (arendahl@wutc.wa.gov)
Confidentiality Status: Public	
On Behalf Of Covad:  Karen S. Frame Covad Communications Company 7901 Lowry Boulevard Denver CO 80230-6906  Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (720) 208-3350 Email (kframe@covad.com)
On Behalf Of Covad:	
Charles E. Watkins Covad Communications Company 1230 Peachtree Street NE, 19th Floor Atlanta GA 30309  Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (404) 942-3495  Email (gwatkins@covad.com)
On Behalf Of Covad, NWCCC:	
Brooks E. Harlow Miller Nash LLP 601 Union Street, Suite 4400 Seattle WA 98101-2352 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 622-7485 X Email (brooks.harlow@millernash.com)

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA (UT-033044) - Page 6 233015\_1.DOC

Confidentiality Status: Public

ATER WYNNE LLP LAWYERS 601 Union Street, Suite 5450 SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-2327 (206) 623-4711

On Behalf Of Covad, NWCCC:	
David L. Rice Miller Nash LLP 601 Union Street, Suite 4400 Seattle WA 98101-2352 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 622-7485 Email (david.rice@millernash.com)
On Behalf Of DoD & Other Federal Agencies:	
Stephen S. Melnikoff US Army Litigation Center Regulatory Law Office 901 N Stuart Street, Suite 700 Arlington VA 22203-1837 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered  U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (703) 696-2960  Email (stephen.melnikoff@hqda.army.mil)
On Behalf Of DoD & Other Federal Agencies:  Robert W. Spangler Snavely King Majoros O'Connor & Lee, Inc. 1220 L Street NW, Suite 410 Washington DC 20005 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (202) 842-4966 Email (rspangler@snavely-king.com)
On Behalf Of Eschelon:	
J. Jeffery Oxley Eschelon Telecom, Inc. 730 2nd Avenue South, Suite 1200 Minneapolis MN 55402-2456 Confidentiality Status: Highly Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (612) 436-6792 Email (jjoxley@eschelon.com)
On Behalf Of Eschelon:	
Dennis D. Ahlers Eschelon Telecom, Inc. 730 2nd Avenue South, Suite 1200 Minneapolis MN 55402-2456 Confidentiality Status: Highly Confidential	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (612) 436-6792 Email (ddahlers@eschelon.com)

On Behalf Of Global Crossing:	
Michael Shortley Global Crossing 1080 Pittsford-Victor Road Pittsford NY 14534 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (585) 381-6781 Email (michael.shortley@globalcrossing.com)
On Behalf Of Global Crossing:  Diane Peters Global Crossing 1080 Pittsford-Victor Road	<ul><li>Hand Delivered</li><li>U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)</li><li>Overnight Mail (UPS)</li></ul>
Pittsford NY 14534  Confidentiality Status: Public	Facsimile (585) 381-6781 Email (diane.peters@globalcrossing.com)
On Behalf Of Integra:	
Deborah Harwood Integra Telecom of Washington, Inc. 19545 NW Von Neumann Dr., Suite 200 Beaverton OR 97006-6906	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (503) 748-1212
Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (deborah.harwood@integratelecom.com)
On Behalf Of Integra:	
Karen J. Johnson Integra Telecom of Washington, Inc. 19545 NW Von Neumann Dr., Suite 200 Beaverton OR 97006-6906 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (503) 748-1212 Email (karen.johnson@integratelecom.com)
On Behalf Of MCI:	
Michel L. Singer Nelson WorldCom, Inc. 707 17th Street, Suite 4200 Denver CO 80202-3432	Hand Delivered  V.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (303) 390-6333
Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (michel.singer_nelson@mci.com)

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA (UT-033044) - Page 8 233015\_1.DOC

On Behalf Of MCI, WeBTEC:	
Lisa F. Rackner Ater Wynne LLP 222 SW Columbia, Suite 1800 Portland OR 97201-6618 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered  U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (503) 226-0079  Email (lfr@aterwynne.com)
On Behalf Of McLeod:	
William Courter McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services, Inc. McLeod USA Technology Park 6400 C Street SW Cedar Rapids IA 52403 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (319) 298-7901 X Email (wcourter@mcleodusa.com)
On Behalf Of McLeod:  William Haas  McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services, Inc.  McLeod USA Technology Park 6400 C Street SW Cedar Rapids IA 52406-3177  Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (319) 790-7901 Email (whaas@mcleodusa.com)
On Behalf Of NWCCC:  Andrew O. Isar  Miller Isar, Inc. 7901 Skansie Avenue, Suite 240 Gig Harbor WA 98335  Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered  U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (253) 851-6474  Email (aisar@millerisar.com)
On Behalf Of PacWest:	
Ethan Sprague PAC/WEST Communications 1776 W March Lane, Suite 250 Stockton CA 95207 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (209) 601-6528 X Email (esprague@pacwest.com)

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA (UT-033044) - Page 9 233015\_1.DOC

On Behalf Of Public Counsel:	
Simon J. ffitch Attorney General of Washington 900 Fourth Avenue, Suite 2000 Seattle WA 98164	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 389-2058
Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (simonf@atg.wa.gov)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Lisa A. Anderl Qwest Corporation 1600 7th Avenue, Room 3206 Seattle WA 98091 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered  V.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (206) 343-4040  Email (lisa.anderl@qwest.com)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Chuck Steese Steese & Evans 6400 S Fiddler's Green Circle, Suite 1820 Denver CO 80111	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (720) 200-0697
Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (csteese@s-elaw.com)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Ted D. Smith Stoel Rives LLP 201 South Main Street, Suite 1100 Salt Lake City UT 84111-4904 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (801) 578-6999 Email (tsmith@stoel.com)
On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Mark S. Reynolds Qwest Corporation 1600 7th Avenue, Room 3206 Seattle WA 98091	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 346-7289
Confidentiality Status: Public	Email (mark.reynolds3@qwest.com)

Confidentiality Status: Public

On Behalf Of Qwest:	
Adam L. Sherr Qwest Corporation 1600 7th Avenue, Room 3206 Seattle WA 98091 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 343-4040 Email (adam.sherr@qwest.com)
Confidentially Status. I worte	
On Behalf Of Sprint:	
Barbara Young Sprint Communications Co. LP 902 Wasco Street A0412 Hood River OR 97031-3105 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (541) 387-9753 Email (barbara.c.young@mail.sprint.com)
On Behalf Of Sprint:	
William E. Hendricks III Sprint Communications Co. LP 902 Wasco Street A0412 Hood River OR 97031-3105	Hand Delivered  X U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (541) 387-9753 Email
Confidentiality Status: Public	(tre.e.hendricks.iii@mail.sprint.com)
On Behalf Of Sprint:	
Nancy L. Judy Sprint Communications Co. LP 902 Wasco Street A0412 Hood River OR 97031-3105 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (541) 387-9753 Email (nancy.judy@mail.sprint.com)
On Behalf Of Staff:	
Jonathan Thompson Attorney General of Washington Utilities & Transportation Division 1400 S Evergreen Park Drive SW PO Box 40128 Olympia WA 98504-0128	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (360) 586-5522 X Email (jthompso@wutc.wa.gov)

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA (UT-033044) - Page 11 233015\_1.DOC

Confidentiality Status: Highly Confidential

On Behalf Of Time Warner:	
Brian D. Thomas Time Warner Telecom 223 Taylor Avenue North Seattle WA 98109-5017 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (206) 676-8001 Email (brian.thomas@twtelecom.com)
On Behalf Of Verizon:	
Timothy O'Connell Stoel Rives LLP 600 University Street, Suite 3600 Seattle WA 98101-3197 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered  U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid)  Overnight Mail (UPS)  Facsimile (206) 386-7500  Email (tjoconnell@stoel.com)
On Behalf Of Verizon:	
Kimberly A. Douglass Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile Email (kimberly.a.douglass@verizon.com)
On Behalf Of Verizon:	
Joan Gage Verizon Corp. 1800 41st Street WA0101RA P.O. Box 1003 Everett WA 98201 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (425) 261-5262 Email (joan.gage@verizon.com)
On Behalf Of XO:	
Rex Knowles XO Oregon, Inc. 111 E Broadway, Suite 1000 Salt Lake City UT 84111 Confidentiality Status: Public	Hand Delivered U.S. Mail (first-class, postage prepaid) Overnight Mail (UPS) Facsimile (801) 983-1504  Email (rex.knowles@xo.com)

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington that the foregoing is true and correct.

WeBTEC'S RESPONSE TO JOINT CLEC MOTION FOR ANONYMOUS DISCLOSURE OF CLEC DATA (UT-033044) - Page 12 233015\_1.DOC

ATER WYNNE LLP
LAWYERS
601 UNION STREET, SUITE 5450
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98101-2327
(206) 623-4711

DATED this 14th day of November, 2003, at Seattle, Washington.

Jul Davenfurt